

Cultural Resources Management Plan

Isle Royale National Park
Michigan
November 2013 • Newsletter #2

National Park Service
Department of the Interior



Left to right: Island Mine Wagon Road (NPS photo); Johns Hotel Restoration, Barnum Island (NPS photo); Fishery at Chippewa Harbor, 1896 (Alfred C. Lane Collection - ISRO archives); AMERICA at Rock Harbor, circa 1920s. (Frank Warren Collection - ISRO archives); Mine shaft, Saginaw Mine (NPS photo).

Dear Friend of Isle Royale,

Thank you for your continued interest in the development of the Isle Royale Cultural Resources Management Plan (CRMP). In our first newsletter, we explained the planning process, introduced you to park foundation documents, and summarized what we heard at the listening sessions and during the first open comment period. In this newsletter, we are introducing draft alternative concepts for your review, providing updates on the foundation document, updating you on the status of planning at Isle Royale, and announcing the public meeting schedule for the Cultural Resources Management Plan. This newsletter is part of the public involvement process for the plan.

There are currently two comprehensive planning efforts underway at Isle Royale National Park—cultural resources planning and wilderness planning. This newsletter focuses on sharing information on our progress on the

Cultural Resources Management Plan for your feedback. This plan builds on previous comprehensive plans for the park; not only the 1998 General Management Plan, but also the ongoing Wilderness and Backcountry Management Plan. The Wilderness and Backcountry Management Plan is currently being revised to reflect current wilderness planning policies, which have changed significantly in the past few years.

Since our last update, a notice of intent to complete the Cultural Resources Management Plan / Environmental Impact Statement (CRMP/EIS) was published in the *Federal Register*. During this time, the National Park Service has also assessed wilderness policy implications on cultural resources management options and conducted a review and analysis of traditionally associated peoples at Isle Royale to better inform the development of the Cultural

Resources Management Plan. The planning team has developed a range of preliminary alternative concepts that provide options for the management, treatment, and interpretation of cultural resources. These draft alternative concepts are summarized in this newsletter.

The planning team will host public meetings this fall to collect feedback on the preliminary alternative concepts and discuss the foundation document. Information for the meetings is included in the newsletter. We invite you to attend the meetings and provide your input on the plan. We look forward to working with you as we plan for the future management of Isle Royale's cultural resources.

Phyllis A. Green
Superintendent
Isle Royale National Park



Senter Point Powder House (NPS photo).



Wreck of GEORGE M. COX, 1933
(Robert E. Johns Collection - ISRO archives).



Snuff Jar, Edison Fishery (NPS photo).



Rock of Ages Lighthouse (NPS photo).



Pre-contact mining pit at Minong Mine, circa 1892 (William H. Holmes Collection - Smithsonian).

PURPOSE AND NEED FOR THE CULTURAL RESOURCES MANAGEMENT PLAN

The purpose of this Cultural Resources Management Plan / Environmental Impact Statement is to develop a long-term comprehensive strategy for managing the cultural resources of Isle Royale National Park. The plan will set priorities for the management of Isle Royale cultural resources and identify future research needs. The plan tiers from the 1998 *Isle Royale Final General Management Plan / Environmental Impact Statement* and will be consistent with wilderness management planning for the park.



Breen/Snell cottage, Tobin Harbor (NPS photo).

FOUNDATION DOCUMENT

As Isle Royale National Park continues to plan for the appropriate management of its cultural resources, it is important that park management, park staff, stakeholders, and the public have a shared understanding of what is most important about the park. The park has drafted a foundation document, which defines the purpose of a park's designation and existence. In addition to purpose, a foundation document clearly articulates the significance, interpretive themes, fundamental resources and values, and special mandates and administrative commitments of a park unit, as well as the legal and policy requirements for administration and resource protection that factor into management decisions. The foundation document therefore provides the underlying guidance- the "foundation"- for all management and planned decisions for each specific national park system unit.

The foundation document helps ensure that planning and management activities stay focused on the park's mission. Park and agency staff members have been working to complete the foundation document for Isle Royale and expect it to be publically available later this fall. The CRMP preliminary alternative concepts in this newsletter were crafted to be consistent with the the draft foundation document.



ALGOMA Helm (NPS photo).





Rock Harbor Lighthouse (NPS photo).

ACTIONS COMMON TO ALL PRELIMINARY ALTERNATIVE CONCEPTS

When this plan is complete, the park will have comprehensive guidance for managing cultural resources for the long term. To decide which alternative, or combination of alternatives, will be the best plan, NPS will evaluate them based on their efficiency, appropriateness, and feasibility, including cost. All preliminary alternatives share some actions in common. These common actions set the ground work for decision-making. They prescribe a minimum, consistent level of management that acknowledges Isle Royale's fundamental human/nature connection, are consistent with law and policy, and aid in retaining the island's special wilderness character. The actions common to all alternatives are:

Wilderness. Isle Royale's wilderness designation is a key consideration for planning at the park. The CRMP will be consistent with the park's Wilderness and Backcountry Management Plan and will manage cultural resources in light of their presence in and adjacent to designated wilderness.

Treatments for Cultural Resources. A variety of ways to treat historic structures, landscapes, and archeological resources are proposed in the preliminary alternatives. Although the treatments vary among the alternatives and range from preservation, restoration, rehabilitation, or stabilization, all will follow the *Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties*. The standards provide a consistent framework and guidance for decision making about work or changes to a historic property.

Inventory of Ethnographic Resources. The National Park Service will increase efforts to inventory, document, and protect ethnographic resources. At this time, only a few ethnographic resources have been identified in the park, so in consultation with traditionally associated tribes and other traditionally associated people, the park will work to inventory traditional cultural sites, archeological sites, and ethnographic landscapes associated with their history and experience on the island.

Private Residential Use of Cabins. Upon expiration, life leases and special use permits authorizing private residential use of publicly owned summer cabins and commercial fishery bases will not be renewed or extended. Similarly, volunteer-in-park agreements issued to families during the development of the CRMP will end. The National Park Service may seek a variety of partnerships and opportunities for cooperation with local communities, government agencies, nonprofit organizations, and other entities that have an interest in helping to implement this plan.



How Cottage, Tobin Harbor (NPS photo).





Minong Resort, circa 1920s
(Frank Warren Collection - ISRO archives).

PRELIMINARY ALTERNATIVE CONCEPTS

The team has identified the following draft alternative concepts for further development.

NO-ACTION ALTERNATIVE

The no-action alternative represents a continuation of current management activities, planning, and practices concerning cultural resources on Isle Royale. This alternative is included as a baseline for comparison of the other alternative concepts. It represents “no action” with regard to this plan and does not imply that the National Park Service would take no further management actions concerning the park’s cultural resources. The no-action alternative places the National Park Service in a mostly reactive role, responding to resource damage, issues, and concerns as they arise. The focus of this alternative would be on those resources that have a high level of integrity and/or where agency initiatives and opportunities for private or nonprofit partnerships and agreements could achieve preservation goals. For all activities, the park would respond to change as necessary to protect park resources, ensure visitor safety, and support visitor experiences.

ALTERNATIVE A

Alternative A maintains a minimal level of resources representing the rich history of human interaction with Isle Royale. This option preserves the fewest number of historic properties. Within and outside the wilderness area, alternative A requires removal or allows deterioration of numerous historic structures and sites and relies heavily on interpretation as the means by which visitors understand the fundamental link between humans and natural resources. Funding and operation of various planning, documentation, treatment, and interpretive programming would be by traditional means through NPS project funding and staffing.

Archeological sites would be documented and monitored and increased efforts would be made to identify ethnographic resources across the park. Outside designated wilderness areas of the park, a limited number of significant cultural resources that are in good condition and represent a variety of Isle Royale historical themes would be stabilized. Most structures in designated wilderness and potential wilderness would be documented and allowed to deteriorate or would be removed.



Minong Lodge Cabin, Tobin Harbor
(NPS photo).

ALTERNATIVE B

Alternative B emphasizes the development of a vibrant program of partnerships intended to help the National Park Service preserve a variety of historic properties reflecting the entire scope of human history at Isle Royale. This alternative concept does not emphasize one historic theme or time period over another and preserves the highest number of historic properties. All cultural resource types (archeological sites, ethnographic resources, historic structures and landscapes—including vernacular boats, submerged cultural resources, and museum collections) would be managed to convey the full range of Isle Royale fishing, mining, maritime navigation, recreation, and other historical themes. Management and interpretation would expand visitor and public education of the layered multicultural human experience in this remote wild environment.



Main Lodge, Crystal Cove (NPS photo).



Rock Harbor scene, circa 1920s
(Farmer Collection - ISRO archives).





John Linklater and Tchi-ki-wis camping, circa 1920s (Frank Warren Collection).

ALTERNATIVE B (CONT'D)

Throughout the park, the National Park Service would stabilize resources while pursuing preservation partnerships and funding for research and planning data necessary for informed cultural resource decision making. Outside designated wilderness, the National Park Service would prepare historic structure reports, cultural landscape reports, and other implementation plans prior to employing a range of preservation treatments, including rehabilitation and adaptive/compatible reuse of structures with partners. In designated wilderness, resources that contribute to scenic qualities, opportunities for solitude and primitive recreation, and the historic values of Isle Royale's wilderness character would be preserved. Here, the National Park Service would consider partnerships to assist in appropriate stabilization and modest preservation treatments with short, selective time frames.



Edisen Fishery (NPS photo).



Copper knife (NPS photo).

ALTERNATIVE C

This alternative focuses on the preservation and active interpretation of the maritime resources of Isle Royale, which are resources associated with fish, fishing, and maritime travel and technology, and the traditional knowledge of those resources. The most expansive and diverse undertakings would occur with the maritime resources outside designated wilderness. Many resources related to other themes in designated wilderness and potential wilderness additions would be documented and removed, or allowed to deteriorate. Alternative C celebrates evidence of the long-established connection between human access to and benefit from Isle Royale's natural bounty in a remote island wilderness setting. The alternative provides widely dispersed visitor opportunities including assessment demonstration fisheries; traditional craft field schools; educational or apprenticeship opportunities focusing on culture camps, fishing technology, sailing, navigation, and traditional boat building craft; canoe rentals; discovery sites; lightkeeper-in-residence and light house keeper re-enactor programs; lighthouse overnight accommodations; and guided scuba dive tours. This alternative would also involve increased inventory and documentation of ethnographic resources related to knowledge of fish, fishing, and maritime skills.



Archeologists at work (NPS photo).

Reliance on a variety of different partnerships, permits, and agreements would be required to achieve many maritime resource preservation goals. This could include collaboration with universities, development of traditional craft field schools or educational camps, and interpretive tour programs. In this alternative, the National Park Service would be responsible for stabilizing buildings and landscape features and protecting threatened archeological sites to maintain properties in good condition until partnerships are in place.



Pond net fishing, circa 1920s (Farmer Collection - ISRO archives).





Hammerstones at Minong Mine, circa 1892
(William H. Holmes Collection - Smithsonian).

ALTERNATIVE D

This alternative emphasizes the park's archeological resources and involves a significant increase in archeological inventory. Research priority would be given to the island's 4,500-plus years of precontact and historic copper mining and fishing, with attention to related sites and landscapes where documentation has been limited to more recent island histories and in areas that have seen little attention in the past including the island interior, relict shorelines, and submerged settings. Within designated wilderness and potential wilderness additions, the park staff would undertake stabilization and protection of a limited number of historic structures; many structures would be allowed to deteriorate or would be removed and/or relocated.

Under this alternative, the park would be promoted as a venue for university field schools. Partnerships with regional institutions and universities would be pursued to facilitate aspects of research using an interdisciplinary approach. Similarly, tribal involvement and supporting field schools or culture camps that promote preservation of traditional cultural knowledge and language would be fostered. Additionally, increased efforts would be made to inventory ethnographic resources.

PROJECT SCHEDULE

Planning Activity	Approximate Time Frame	Public Involvement Opportunities
Public Scoping – identify concerns, expectations, and values related to the park and to the draft alternative concepts.	November – December 2013	Review newsletter and attend public meetings. Send us your ideas and concerns using the response form or via the website.
Develop alternatives and prepare draft cultural resources management plan / environmental impact statement.	Late 2013 – Fall 2014	
Release draft cultural resources management plan / environmental impact statement to the public.	Late 2014	Review document and voice your ideas and concerns.
Review and analyze public comments, and revise draft document.	Mid to late 2015	
Implementation of approved plan.	2016 and beyond	Work with park staff to implement the approved plan.

WAYS TO COMMENT AND PROVIDE INPUT

At this time, the superintendent of Isle Royale National Park is announcing a second public scoping period to solicit public comments on the draft alternative concepts. During this period, the public is invited to identify any issues or concerns they might have with the project so the National Park Service can appropriately consider them in the planning process. **Public meetings will be held from 6 to 8 pm in Houghton, MI, on November 12; in the Ann Arbor, MI, area on November 14; in St. Paul, MN, on November 19; and in Duluth, MN, on November 20.** Check <http://parkplanning.nps.gov/ISROcrmp>, the park website at www.nps.gov/isro, or call the park at 906-482-0984 for specific times, locations, and directions.

You may submit your comments electronically only on the NPS planning website (<http://parkplanning.nps.gov/ISROcrmp>). Once on the website, click "Open for Comment" in the left sidebar, and then select "Cultural Resource Management Plan." To submit a comment, select "Comment on Document" from the left menu.

If you are unable to access the website, please submit written comments by December 4, 2013, to:

National Park Service
Attention: Brenda Todd, ISRO CRMP Project Manager
Denver Service Center, Planning Division
PO Box 25287
Denver, CO 80225-0287

Before including your address, phone number, e-mail address, or other personal identifying information in your comment, you should be aware that your entire comment (including your personal identifying information) may be publicly available at any time. Although you can ask us in your comment to withhold your personal identifying information from public review, we cannot guarantee that we will be able to do so.



Cultural Resources Management Plan

Isle Royale National Park

Michigan

November 2013 • Newsletter #2

National Park Service
Department of the Interior



INSIDE THIS ISSUE...

This newsletter includes information about a project to develop a cultural resources management plan, which will enable the park to proactively manage cultural resources. The newsletter includes information on the park's planning efforts, issues and opportunities to be addressed in this project, some preliminary draft alternative concepts, the project time line, and ways to provide your input and comment. Inside the newsletter is a comment form that we ask you to fill out and mail to us so that we can better understand your concerns and ideas. Public meetings will be held from 6 to 8 pm in Houghton, MI, on November 12; in the Ann Arbor, MI, area on November 14; in St. Paul, MN, on November 19; and in Duluth, MN, on November 20. Check <http://parkplanning.nps.gov/ISROcrmp>, the park website at www.nps.gov/isro, or call the park at 906-482-0984 for specific times, locations, and directions.

Thank you for interest and support in Isle Royale National Park!

FIRST-CLASS MAIL
POSTAGE & FEES PAID
NATIONAL PARK SERVICE
PERMIT NO. G-83

United States Department of the Interior
National Park Service
Denver Service Center-Brenda Todd DSC-P
12795 West Alameda Parkway
PO Box 25287
Denver CO 80225-0287
OFFICIAL BUSINESS
PENALTY FOR PRIVATE USE \$300

